

Case Studies

Q1. A new Indian Police Service incumbent, after completion of his training, has joined first posting in a district.

- (i) Some influential people, outside his office as well as subordinates in his office come to meet him and offer him valuable gifts as a welcome gesture.
- (ii) He has also been told by his subordinates that, there is a channel of money collection by the police of the area from commercial vehicles, shanty vendors and shopkeepers as well as spurious liquor lobby, etc, share of which would automatically reach to the new officer. This money is unaccounted and does not go to the establishment.
 - (a) The officer is in dilemma. Whether he should accept the gifts as a welcome gesture from influential people outside the office or only from his official colleagues or from both? What according to you should be his course of action? Give reasons.
 - (b) Should he take the share from unaccounted money mentioned above? If not what would be professionally and ethically correct decision for him.

Q2. While implementing Centrally and State Sponsored Development Programmes a Civil Servant faces lot of interference from the local political leaders to oblige certain contractors and service providers who do not qualify the required eligibility criteria on

the one hand and moreover uses substandard material in construction and provide poor quality of service on the other. He finds it immensely difficult to keep his neutrality and do what is best in the public interest. He is very disturbed. He thinks on the following options:

- (a) He informs the senior officers, but every time he does so, he finds that somehow they are not ready to annoy the local influential politicians. He thinks about taking up the issue with the further higher up officers in the hierarchy.
- (b) He thinks about meeting the media people and tell them about the difficulties faced by him due to political interference and lack of support from the senior officers.
- (c) Resign from his post as public servant and fight against such malpractices from outside.

Evaluate every option before him and suggest which of the above stated course of action is the best?

- Q3.** Around 50,000 people have been affected in a devastating flood in one of the state capital of our country. 30,000 evacuated and moved to safe place. Supply of essential commodities has been disrupted. Schools and colleges have been closed and scheduled exams have been postponed. Several train services have also been cancelled.

You are head of a disaster management team that has been assigned with the work of rescuing and rehabilitating thousands of people who have been affected by an unprecedented flood. Team members include revenue officials, doctors, engineers and security personnel. However some of the local leaders of a political party are not happy. A powerful minister of the government visits the area to make a first hand assessment of the situation and in the process meets the local politicians who are not happy. The

minister announces for the suspension of two of your officials. Your entire work force gets demoralized due to this announcement and are unwilling to perform under given situation.

- (a) What are the ethical issues involved?
- (b) What are the options before you?
- (c) Discuss each option.

Q4. Mr. X is heading procurement division in a government department; he is currently handling procurement of material for ongoing important project. It is his new assignment.

Mr. X was surprised to see the chaos prevailing in the office. The environment in the office was not conducive for efficient functioning. Proper interpersonal communication among staff was missing. Officials used to complain against each other regarding their day-to-day official working.

There used to be a huge gathering of contractors in the office every day vitiating the environment in the office. In fact chaos used to prevail in the office and work was hampered to a great extent. There used to be unnecessary contact everyday between the contractor and the officials.

Mr. X could sense the vicious circle in which entire procurement setup was trapped into. Most of the staffs were highly demotivated. He could sense that the staffs were intelligent and know their jobs appropriately. All the staffs were not happy about the prevailing conditions in the office especially of relationships amongst staff. Even the contractors had a feeling of suffocation in such a situation. All the stakeholders were working in most disjointed manner causing harm to the system and vitiating the environment. What are the possible decision options available to Mr. X to improve the overall environment?

Q5. This is a situation which pertain to Parliament elections. You are posted as District Magistrate in one of the notorious district. There were several officer to assist you in your work, i.e. Returning Officer, District Election Officer and Additional District Magistrate (ADM).

Background duties of various officers were assigned as presiding officers were unwilling to take up election duties as it was very arduous work and a big responsibility.

Presiding officers and polling officers were called four days before the poll for training and collection of material/stationary like voters list, manuals, ballot papers etc. In one such event, when the distribution of material was being made, one polling officer had a heated argument with ADM which resulted in a scuffle. There were around 300 polling personnel who formed a mob as most of them were unhappy because they had been put on election duty. ADM locked his room from inside to save himself from attack by this furious mob. This mob was not willing to cooperate in further duty.

How would you handle the situation? What are the possible alternatives available?

Q6. What do you mean by 'Ethical Dilemmas'? Illustrate it through a suitable example. You are a police officer and your bodyguard has once saved your life by putting his life on risk. He has taken Rs. 500 from a person to help the man to get a favorable recommendation from you for grant of an arms license. Another police personnel has told you about the matter. The case of arms license is genuine and your bodyguard makes a request to do the same. What will be your response?

Q7. Suppose you are the CEO of a company that manufactures specialized electronic equipment used by a government department. You have submitted your bid for the supply of this equipment to the department. Both the quality and cost of your offer are better than those of the competitors. Yet the concerned officer is demanding a hefty bribe for approving the tender. Getting the order is important both for you and for your company. Not getting the order would mean closing a production line. It may also affect your own career. However, as a value-conscious person, you do not want to give bribe.

Valid arguments can be advanced both for giving the bribe and getting the order, and for refusing to pay the bribe and risking the loss of the order. What those arguments could be? Could there be any better way to get out of this dilemma? If so outline the main elements of this third way, pointing out its merits.

Q8. Now-a-days, there is an increasing thrust on economic development all around the globe. At the same time, there is also an increasing concern about environmental degradation caused by development. Many a time, we face a direct conflict between developmental activity and environmental quality. It is neither feasible to stop or curtail the development process, nor it is advisable to keep degrading the environment, as it threatens our very

survival. Discuss some feasible strategies which could be adopted to eliminate this conflict and which could lead to sustainable development.

Q9. Suppose one of your close friends, who is also aspiring for civil services, comes to you for discussing some of the issues related to ethical conduct in public service. He raises the following points :

- (a) In the present times, when unethical environment is quite prevalent, individual attempts to stick to ethical principles may cause a lot of problems in one's career. It may also cause hardship to the family members as well as risk to one's life. Why should we not be pragmatic and follow the path of least resistance, and be happy with doing whatever good we can?
- (b) When so many people are adopting wrong means and are grossly harming the system, what difference would it make if only a small minority tries to be ethical? They are going to be rather ineffective and are bound to get frustrated.
- (c) If we become fussy about ethical considerations, will it not hamper the economic progress of our country? After all, in the present age of high competition, we cannot afford to be left behind in the race of development.
- (d) It is understandable that we should not get involved in grossly unethical practices, but giving and accepting small gratifications and doing small favours increases everybody's motivation. It also makes the system more efficient. What is wrong in adopting such practices?

Critically analyze the above viewpoints. On the basis of this analysis, what will be your advice to your friend?

Q10. There is a disaster-prone State having frequent landslides, forest fires, cloudbursts, flash floods and earthquakes, etc. Some of these are seasonal and often unpredictable. The magnitude of the disaster is always unanticipated. During one of the seasons, a cloudburst caused devastating floods and landslides leading to high casualties. There was major damage to infrastructure like roads, bridges and power generating units. This led to more than 100000 pilgrims, tourists and other locals trapped across different routes and locations. The people trapped in your area of responsibility included senior citizens, patients in hospitals, women and children, hiker, tourists, ruling party's, regional president along with his family, additional chief secretary of the neighboring state and prisoners in jail.

As a civil services officer of the state, what would be the order in which you would rescue these people and why? Give justifications.

Q11. Suppose you are an officer in-charge of implementing a social service scheme to provide support to old and destitute women. An old and illiterate woman comes to you to avail the benefits of the scheme. However, she has no documents to show that she fulfils the eligibility criteria. But after meeting her and listening to her you feel that she certainly needs support. Your enquiries also show that she is really destitute and living in a pitiable condition. You are in a dilemma as to what to do. Putting her under the scheme without are documents would clearly be violation of rules. But denying her the support would be cruel and inhuman.

- (a) Can you think of a rational way to resolve this dilemma?
- (b) Give your reasons for it.

Q12. A fresh engineering graduate gets a job in a prestigious chemical industry. She likes the work. The salary is also good. However, after a few months she accidentally discovers that a highly toxic waste is being secretly discharged into a river nearby. This is causing health problems to the villagers downstream who depend on the river for their water needs. She is perturbed and mentions her concern to her colleagues who have been with the company for longer periods. They advise her to keep quite as anyone who mentions the topic is summarily dismissed. She cannot risk losing her job as she is the sole bread-winner for her family and has to support her ailing parents and siblings. At first, she thinks that if her seniors are keeping quiet, why should she stick out her neck. But her conscience pricks her to do something to save the river and the people who depend upon it. At heart she feels that the advice of silence given by her friends is not correct through she cannot give reasons for it. She thinks you are a wise person and seeks your advice.

- (a) What arguments can you advance to show her that keeping quiet is not morally right?
- (b) What course of action would you advise her to adopt and why?

Q13. You are a young, aspiring and sincere employee in a Government office working as an assistant to the director of your department. Since you have joined recently, you need to learn and progress. Luckily your superior is very kind and ready to train you for your job. He is a very intelligent and well-informed person having knowledge of various

departments. In short, you respect your boss and are looking forward to learn a lot from him.

Since you have a good tuning with the boss, he started depending on you. One day due to ill health he invited you at his place for finishing some urgent work.

You reached his house and before you could ring the bell you heard shouting noises. You waited for a while. After entering the house the boss greeted you and explained the work. But you were constantly disturbed by the crying of a woman. At last, you inquired with the boss but his answer did not satisfy you.

Next day, you were compelled to inquire further in the office and found out that his behaviour is very bad at home with his wife. He also beats up his wife.

His wife is not well educated and is a simple woman in comparison to her husband. You see that though your boss is a nice person in the office, he is engaged in domestic violence at home.

In such a situation, you are left with the following options. Analyse each option with its consequences.

- (a) Just ignore thinking about it because it is their personal matter.
- (b) Report the case to the appropriate authority.
- (c) Your own innovative approach towards the situation.

