

ETHICS CASE STUDY TEST

Time Allowed: 1.5 hrs.

Max. Marks: 120

Q.	Marks	Instructions to Candidate
1.		<ul style="list-style-type: none">• There are 6 questions.• All questions are compulsory• The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.• Content of the answer is more important than its length.• Answers must be written in the space provided.• Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.
2.		
3.		
4.		
5.		
6.		

1. Invigilator Signature _____

2. Invigilator Signature _____
Name Jai kishan

Roll No. _____

Mobile No. _____

Date 4/ Aug/ 2017Signature _____


Roll No. _____

Q1. You are a head of Water Supply Board of a district town and in-charge of supplying drinking water to the people. You had a detailed consultation with people regarding a Citizen Charter for water supply services. Based on the requirement and expectations of people, you had a discussion with your subordinates, who were little reluctant about the Charter but seeing your positive attitude they ultimately agreed. You committed some hurry in implementation of the Charter and notice the following problems:

1. The quantum of water promised could not be ensured.
2. The quality of water did not improve.
3. One of your key functionaries went on a long leave and you did not get his replacement.
4. The entire blame on the failure of the Charter came on you.

Ponder over the situation and answer the following questions:

- (a) What were the reasons of failure of the Citizen Charter?
- (b) What should have been ideal course of action and why?
- (c) Draw a Citizen's Charter for this case. (250 Words) (20 Marks)

Citizen's charters are the promises which an organisation intends to make to its client or people, at the same time it acts as an empowering tool to the general public.

- a) In above case, the reasons for failure of Citizen's charter are :-
- (1) The charter was drafted hurriedly without taking into account the functional capacity of the organisation.
 - (2) ~~Secretary~~ the apprehensions among the subordinate makes the poor draft of the charter.

Remarks

(8) Finally, prolonged vacation of the employee reduced the manpower available for the efficient implementation of the charter.

In above case, all stakeholders were not properly considered. Ideally, it should have been drafted by taking following measures:-

Consultation with all stakeholders:-

It includes consultation with the subordinates, other contractors.

Proper Data collection:- The charter should have been drafted after proper data collection like - daily dispensation of water (current) and promised amount of water.

Infrastructure and Finance:-

In above case, for two reasons infrastructure revamp is needed

- (a) to increase quantity of water
- (b) to enhance quality.

Both requires time and investment. Hence, the timeline promised in the charter

should have been prolonged. Further, guidance addresses should have been there so as to ensure real time monitoring.

Remarks

ABC MUNICIPAL CORPORATION
WATER SUPPLY BOARD

Vision and Mission

To ensure a minimum quantity of quality water to all the inhabitants of ABC irrespective of their socio-economic status.

Services to be provided

1) The quantity of water available would be increased incrementally.

2) The timing of water supply would be increased so that more time is available to the working class people to store water.

3) The corporation would scale up its infrastructure so that quality of water is not compromised.

4) The metering of water units would be done.

5) Hassle free water connection to the each household.

Grievances

For any grievances contact

ABC
Senior Manager

Mob - 9999955555

email :- abcprmo@gmail.com

Remarks

(Handwritten signature)

Q2. You are a civil servant and posted at a place with multi-cultural and multi-identity population with one dominant majority group and a big minority group. There arose a dispute on setting up statues of their respective icons in the area, cross claiming the same space. Any casual or delay will cost huge as past history indicates of big conflicts. Election is round the corner so different interest groups are eyeing to reap the benefits and has tensed the environment. Answer the following questions:

- What preventive steps would you take to stop flaring up of a brewing dispute?
- If the dispute flares up and turns violent, what would be your quick measures to contain it?
- How do you react when failure to pre-empt and contain such a situation leads to your suspension?

(250 Words) (20 Marks)

India is a multi-cultural nation, and often we see politically driven clashes among two communities. Here, the role of the civil servant is to keep the public order under control at any cost.

a) In order to stop flaring up of brewing dispute following steps can be taken:-

Reaching to local leaders of both group:-

The leaders of the respective group can be requested to keep the situation under control by not flaring up the issue, ensuring them that impartial inquiry to be taken about ownership of ~~land~~ and setting up of statues.

④ Intelligence:- The civil servant must ensure that intelligence from local society comes up. Supporting up of police and Rapid Action Force:-

Remarks

This is to ensure that in case of any unforeseen violence, proper police force is there to control the violence.

In order to pacify the groups, temporarily ~~either~~ both parties should not be allowed to place JH statue. After proper inquiry and negotiation, the administration could allow the setting up of statues.

(b) As the dispute turns violent and in this case following steps can be taken:

Arrest of JH perpetrators :- This is to ensure that some fear comes in the minds of violence promoters including the local leaders.

~~Step~~ calling extra police force, if possible Rapid action force can be requested.

Taking consultation from senior authority :-

This would minimise the chances of error because senior authorities have experience and stepped decision making capacity.

Remarks

Ensuring the safety of people specially the colonies of minority group. This is because in most cases, minorities are often victimised. Hence, extra care needs to be taken to ensure the safety of their localities.

(c) Being a civil servant, it is an obligation ~~of~~ on my part to control the situations which may spiral up into riots.

In above case, even if I am suspended, I would have some options left -

(a) To put my views to the senior authorities, ~~my~~ actions taken and steps followed to minimise the ~~error~~.

(b) There would be disappointment because of
 # Unable to control the situation and
 # Because of suspension.

However, these are testing times for a civil servant. I have self belief that I did my best and in due course of time, the truth will prevail. The failure on my part is the cause of suspension even though I tried my best.

Remarks

8

Q3. A region has been affected by the flood. It has impacted huge population and led to their displacement. Majority of them have no food and shelter. You are an officer in charge for relief and rescue operations in a flood hit area where a big section of youth, not having trust in the state agencies have agitated against the latter demanding secession. However, while carrying out relief and rescue operations, you find out that a select group of youth turns hostile, resorts to stone pelting against the soldiers and also using some violent methods. It disrupts relief operation. Force present on the occasion also retaliates and a few youth got injured in this incident. This further aggravates the situation. One powerful minister suspends two of your team members. Whole team is de-motivated. What options do you have to handle the situation?

(250 Words) (20 Marks)

Natural Hazards are one of those moments where the army directly interacts with the citizens. In moments of grief, the Army can win the hearts of even enemies and many times it has been done so.

Here, the chief task is to supply relief works efficiently and quickly. In order to do so, the steps available are:-

Persuading the local leaders:-

They can be taken help of in order to minimise the cases of stone pelting. This would ensure efficient rescue and relief operations.

Asking the subordinates to show maximum

restraint:- This would make sure that the manpower is not wasted into handling confrontations with the local youths and the stone pelters. The real task is to save

Remarks

lives of the flood affected people,
not to retaliate. ~~with~~

* A motivating the subordinates and soldiers

suspension of two members of the team
will certainly demotivate the people. The
team must be motivated by :-

(a) Revisiting the oath taken by them
to serve the nation in the distress
hours.

(b) Ensuring them that both of the team
members would be given fair opportunity
to ~~also~~ give their opinions. Fair trial
option would be provided to all the
soldiers.

(c) Asking them to fulfill their obligation.

* Talking with the Ministers :-

Ministers should be explained that
unilateral suspension of the officers
demotivate the soldiers. And it really
affects the relief and rescue operations.

Remarks

objectivity
could have been
better

Arresting and preventive Detention:-

In extreme cases, if local leaders and youths are not cooperating with the forces, local police can be asked to arrest those who are confront to violence.

In such cases, extreme measures like use of ~~para~~ force can be allowed.

In above case, the force is facing two hazards -

(a) Natural Hazard due to flood

(b) Man-made due to stone-pelting.

In this crisis hour, maximum care to be taken to ensure better relief and rescue work, any actions which bring down efficiency should be avoided.

6

Remarks

Q4. Due to fall in agricultural productivity and faulty procurement policy, a marginal family head has committed suicide and left his family and two children, daughter (12 years) and son (8 years). They shifted to nearby city in search of work and ended up living in a slum. Both children had to leave their studies and mother went searching for some household work. Finally she is a maid at your home. She works at your personal residence. One day she felt ill and ask her daughter to continue in place of her. Your wife is an IAS officer and quite busy. She does not have time to take care of old in-laws who needs constant care. Though there is a nurse to take care of them but there is a need of help in small household works also. So she gave consent to daughter of maid to continue in place of her. As she fears that your family may engage someone else and she will loose livelihood opportunity. When you raised the concern, she replied that this is matter of few weeks only, and also saying no will bring them on street. As in such a metro city one cannot survive without work, everything has a cost. You are Mayor of the city.

- (a) What are the ethical dilemmas related to it?
- (b) Your wife is in support of her placement as domestic worker as it will help her in balancing household and work responsibilities. Do you find her justification right?
- (c) How will you persuade her to change her decision? (250 Words) (20 Marks)

Poverty and poor conditions of slums are the parts of India's growing urbanisation. The most disadvantageous among them are women and children.

(a) The ethical dilemmas before me are empathy for the poor maid and her child, and responsibility as a child to take care of the parents.

Here, dilemma is also about my obligation as a public officer, employing a girl child as a maid means it is

Remarks

violation of law - prohibition of child labour act.

b) In above case, employing a minor child as a domestic helper is violation of law. Hence, the reasons given that replacement of the ~~child~~ mother with her child is not right.

It has certain demerits -

violation of law.

Secondly, morally taking help from a child who is 12 years old is also wrong. This age is special for children as it is the age of education, recreation.

Thirdly, this would motivate the mother of the child and in future too, she would employ the child in other domestic households.

A few merits can also be found:-

This would ensure continuity of work and sustained income.

However, I would not find it reasonable to employ a girl child. In

Remarks

above case, it would be better to hire a maid temporarily for a brief period and ensure that the previous maid would not lose her job when she comes back.

(c) In order to persuade the wife, following things can be done:-
Remind her about legality of the case:-

Here, employing a minor below 14 years is illegal; being a public servant it becomes more imminent to adhere to law.

Ensure that the previous maid would continue to work when she comes back temporarily, another maid can be hired for a few days or month. The previous maid would be given paid holidays so that her livelihood income does not cease.

By respecting our obligations and showing some empathy, such dilemmas can be easily solved.

Remarks

Q5. You are a doctor in a government hospital. One of your lady friends got married in very rich and influential family. However, with passage of time you came to know that the family is very conservative as she visited you to seek your help in determining sex of the child at fetus stage. As her in-laws want a boy child to act as inheritor of the family. They have also ordered to abort the child if it is girl. Later her in-laws insisted hard and connected the doctor with the health minister on mobile phone. The minister said the doctor to help them in all possible manners without saying anything about the issue at hand. Thus reporting about the issue to police is waste.

Answer the following questions:

- What are the ethical dilemmas in the above case?
- Do you think that your moral obligation also demands to help your friend?
- A doctor in a public or government hospital should obey the health minister for whatever he says. Do you agree and why?
- What steps will you take in the above situation? (250 Words) (20 Marks)

Even after making the sex determination, a criminal offence, the patriarchal Indian society still finds ways to determine the gender of the fetus. Unfortunately, in above case the Health minister himself is involved.

- a) In above case, there is no dilemma. This is because out of two choices, available-
- # Helping the friend in determination of sex of the fetus and
 - # To save the child from being aborted if it is girl.

The prior choice is illegal and immoral. According to, the conception and the Nafaf

Remarks

Diagnosis and the gender determination of the fetus is illegal. Hence, here I don't find any competing options. Hence, no dilemma.

(b) The moral obligation demands to help the blind. But this help should be saving the baby child, saving the blind from committing a crime of sex determination.

Morally, I am not obliged to help him in gender determination of the baby/fetus.

(c) A public servant often finds at crossroads when instructions from higher authorities are illegal. Only a courageous public servant comes out of such situations and ensure the impartiality and obligation.

Hence, in above case, the public servant i.e. the doctor is not obliged to follow the orders of the Health minister blindly. The actions of the public servant must be guided by -

- (a) Laws and conventions
- (b) The code of conduct and
- (c) Goodness to the society

Remarks

The Health Minister may be a commanding boss, but he is bound to act ~~best~~ in consonance with the law. In above case, the orders of the Health Minister are illegal.

(d) In above situation, the following step can be taken.

Persuade Family Members:-

The family members of the friend can be persuaded that they should drop the idea of sex determination because -

- It is illegal.
- morally too, ~~wrong~~ prejudices based on gender is wrong.
- There is no difference in the ability of a boy and girl. They should come out of the patriarchal society.

Reporting to competent authority:-

If police does not support, there are many N.G.Os, Ministry of Women and Children where one can approach for seeking help.

Remarks

9

Q6. An officer of middle level marketing and sales management of a public sector oil company has received frequent complaint about adulteration of diesel and petrol by some retailers of the area under his jurisdiction despite his warnings in the past against such wrongdoing. Subsequently one day, he goes for an inspection of one such retailer who is known for his political connections as well as local bullies. While trying to carry out his official duty, he was first prevented from entering into the premises of the retailer and when he insisted he was allowed to enter. He was offered bribe for not carrying out his duty but he declined. Undeterred, he insisted that as the marketing officer he should be allowed to carry out his duties in public interest and in the interest of the government firm which he represents. The musclemen of the retailer started abusing and roughing him up when he tried to inspect the facilities to ascertain adulteration. A brawl ensued. He was badly beaten up and fatally wounded. He lost his life while being taken to the hospital.

Answer the following questions:

- Was the officer carrying the inspection at fault?
- Despite his noble intention and dutifulness of the highest order, do you think that the officer handled the case immaturely? Why?
- Had you been in his place, how would have you proceeded to carry out your duty?
- What could be the solution for such problems of adulteration on a lasting basis?

(250 Words) (20 Marks)

There may be declining trend in social values, but there are certainly many living heroes who fight corruption and often pay dearly by losing their lives.

(a) No, the officer carrying inspection was not at fault. However, the officer should have taken precautions before raiding the petrol pump. He would have taken the help of local police, local media and other

Remarks

competent authorities.

He would have sensed the situation at the petrol pump and avoided the confrontations.

(b) Yes, the officer handled the case imprudently. This is because -

Hasty raid :- He raided the petrol pump hastily.

Lack of precautions :- Despite knowing the fact that the petrol pump was owned by a local bully, he did not make any precautions.

No help from police :- He did not sought any help from the local police.

(c) In above case, the following step would have been taken:-

(1) Inform the police - The police help should have been sought. This would ensure that no obstruction is caused by the local "goondas" of the petrol pump owner.

Remarks

at the same time this would have saved the life of officer. Such local medical help could have provided the assistance. Finally, personal aid with no help from others was also unwise. However, the intention of the officer is undoubtedly good.

(d) Adulteration has become a new normal whether it is adulteration of food, milk, or oil. To prevent adulteration :-

- # Regular inspection of petrol pumps
- # Ensure that the petrol pumps make compliance with the standards of oil
- # If petrol pumps are found violating the compliance, the licences of such pumps should be cancelled.

Preventive measures like - grant of licences should be based on merit, and no bias

and no preferences to birth and line of any politician should be made

- # The owners of such petrol pumps must be prosecuted

Remarks

9

